



## Public Accounts Committee Records of Meetings

Year: 2019

The following records of meetings have been approved by the Committee.

Signed

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Sarah Ferguson'.

Senator Sarah Ferguson

Chairman  
Public Accounts Committee

## Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 14th January 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott Mr Adrian Lane
Apologies	Deputy Carina Alves
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting of 3rd December 2018.</p>	
<p><b>2. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>Deputy Huelin advised that although a report on the future hospital had been delivered by the Future Hospital policy development board to conclude the first planned phase of its work, it was unclear whether the board would continue with a second phase. He agreed to keep the Committee informed. Deputy Huelin also advised he had been asked to join a 'technology/digital' board to be chaired by Senator Farnham. However it had not met and the Terms of Reference were not finalised. He would inform the Committee of these as soon as possible.</p> <p>The Chairman advised she had been asked to join a migration policy development board but that there was no conflict of interest with the PAC.</p>	
<p><b>3. States' Audit</b></p> <p>The Committee noted responses to its questions to the Treasurer and the Chair of the States of Jersey Audit Committee in relation to the overall project management of the changes being made to financial reporting. It had also agreed to ask for a list of risks and mitigations in relation to reporting in March rather than May.</p> <p>The Committee agreed to await the completion of the States' Audit before asking for clarification on a number of points.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>4. C&amp;AG Audit Plan 2019 and Project Specifications</b></p> <p>The C&amp;AG updated the Committee on the Audit Plan. She advised on the progress of a review into the 'States as Shareholder', and detailed the project specification of 'Handling and Learning from Complaints'. She also advised she would be reviewing non-ministerial departments. The Committee noted she had spoken to the States Employment Board pursuant to her review on that body and was hoping to publish her report around 21st March 2019.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>5. Public Finance Law</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled that some members had attended the joint briefing given by the Treasurer and other senior officers on the proposed Law, with members of the</p>	<b>CT</b>

<p>Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) on Friday 11th January. The C&amp;AG advised she had comments to make on the draft Law but only insofar as whether the proposed changes addressed her recommendations. The Committee agreed it would share those comments with the CSSP. It also agreed a sub-panel should be established with members of CSSP and the Chairman of PAC. The sub-panel would review the draft Law, both before and after it was lodged <i>au Greffe</i>. Accordingly, the PAC agreed to request the Treasurer to provide documentation including the manual referenced by him in the briefing which would replace the current Financial Directions, together with an explanatory document detailing the purpose of the proposed changes.</p>	
<p><b>6. Visit Jersey</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the Director-General, Growth, Housing and Environment's response to the C&amp;AG's report on Visit Jersey. It agreed to await the response from the Chief Executive Officer of Visit Jersey before publishing them together.</p>	
<p><b>7. Recurring Themes Review</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed that the Chairman of the PAC would be co-opted onto the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel for its Finance Transformation review to ensure there was no duplication between that work and the PAC's own review into Recurring Themes. Having noted voluminous documentation submitted by the Chief Executive and other senior officers, it requested its Officer to draft heads of a report so that it could ascertain which information it should include in the first of its six reviews.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>8. Review of Estate Management</b></p> <p>The Committee considered a draft report and agreed the main factual body of it should be sent to the witnesses (subject to minor amendments). The Committee agreed to give more thought to its draft findings and recommendations and submit suggestions to the Officer by the end of the week. An amended version would then be circulated, for signing off for presentation to the States and publication before the end of January 2019.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>9. Westminster visit</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed not to confirm the proposed dates of 26-28 February for its Westminster visit until it had received confirmation that a States debate on the future hospital would not take place at the same time.</p>	
<p><b>10. Next Meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the next meeting would be held in Blampied Room, on 28th January at 1pm.</p>	

## Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 28th January 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly Ms Moz Scott Mr Adrian Lane
Apologies	Deputy Carina Alves Mr Tim Rogers
In attendance	Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General (DC&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting of 14th January 2019.</p>	
<p><b>2. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>Deputy Huelin advised that although a report on the future hospital had been delivered by the Future Hospital policy development board to conclude the first planned phase of its work, it was still unclear whether the board would continue with a second phase. He agreed to keep the Committee informed. Deputy Huelin also reminded the Committee that he had been asked to join a 'technology/digital' board to be chaired by Senator Farnham, although the Terms of Reference were not finalised.</p>	
<p><b>3. C&amp;AG Audit Plan 2019 and Project Specifications</b></p> <p>The Deputy C&amp;AG updated the Committee on the Audit Plan. He advised on the progress of reviews, including housing repairs and maintenance, implementation of FOI, use of enforcement powers and non-ministerial departments.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>4. Public Finance Law</b></p> <p>The Committee approved a paper laying out the proposals for establishing a review into the proposed Law. It noted that the Chairman would be co-opted onto the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) to review the Law and a private briefing by the Minister and senior officers would take place on 8th February. Ms Scott and Mr Lane expressed an interest in attending.</p> <p>The Committee recalled it had received the manual and KPMG report referenced by the Treasurer in the first briefing. However a request for an explanatory document detailing the purpose of the proposed changes to the Law had not been received. A senior Treasury officer had advised that no such explanatory document or law drafting instructions were available.</p> <p>The Committee noted the C&amp;AG had comments to make on the proposed Law insofar as it facilitated the implementation of her recommendations.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>5. Visit Jersey</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed to consider the response from the Chief Executive Officer of Visit Jersey to the C&amp;AG's report, before presenting and publishing it together with the</p>	

Executive Response already received by the Director-General, Growth, Housing and Environment (GHE).	
<p><b>6. Recurring Themes Review</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that a sub-Panel would be formed, with members of CSSP, the Chairman of the PAC and potentially one other member, to review finance transformation and other aspects of the Government Programme. This would not overlap with the planned work for the PAC's own review into Recurring Themes. The Committee approved the draft heads of the first report into organisational culture and corporate learning and agreed it would not wish to seek additional information at this time. It requested the officer to prepare draft heads of report for the second report into decision making, for consideration at the next meeting.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>7. Review of Estate Management</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the main factual body of the report had been sent to the witnesses but a response had not been received. It approved the final report and a press release.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>8. Westminster visit</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed it did not wish to travel to Westminster on the proposed dates of 26-28 February and requested alternative dates that did not fall on a States' sitting week.</p>	
<p><b>9. Next Meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the next meeting would be held in Blampied Room, on 11th February at 1pm.</p>	

## Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 11th February 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers
Apologies	Deputy Carina Alves Ms Moz Scott
In attendance	Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General (DC&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting of 28th January 2019.</p>	
<p><b>2. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>Deputy Huelin advised that it was still unclear whether the future hospital board would continue with a second phase.</p>	
<p><b>3. C&amp;AG Audit Plan 2019 and Project Specifications</b></p> <p>The Deputy C&amp;AG advised there was some progress on the upcoming reviews and that there would be a fuller update in the March meeting.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>4. Public Finance Law</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the Chairman, co-opted onto the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) to review the Law, had attended a private briefing by the Minister and senior officers on 8th February. The members had raised several points for clarification and a letter would be sent to the Treasurer in the next few days. The Committee noted the C&amp;AG had comments to make on the proposed Law insofar as it facilitated the implementation of her recommendations.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>5. Visit Jersey</b></p> <p>The Committee considered the response from the Chief Executive Officer of Visit Jersey to the C&amp;AG's report, and agreed to present it to the States together with the Executive Response already received by the Director-General, Growth, Housing and Environment (GHE). The Committee noted its disappointment with the responses, in particular the one from the Director General, concluding that it was lacking in detail and failed to address adequately the failings identified. It agreed to write to the Chief Executive, asking for his comments on its adequacy. It also agreed the Chairman should ask a question in the States debate about how the £5 million spent on Visit Jersey represented value for money, given that the Director General had not progressed any significant plans to align its function with strategic objectives.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>6. Recurring Themes Review</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that a sub-Panel would be formed, with members of CSSP, the Chairman of the PAC and potentially one other member, to review finance transformation and other aspects of the Government Programme, although this had</p>	<b>CT</b>

<p>not advanced since the last meeting. The Committee approved a rough draft of the report fact-finding and asked the Officer to edit further for consideration. It also noted draft heads of report for the second report into decision making, and asked the officer to draft a question plan prior to the public hearing with the Chief Executive on 25th February 2019.</p>	
<p><b>7. Review of Estate Management</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the report had been presented to the States and published on 4th February and agreed to request an Executive Response.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>8. Westminster visit</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that it would not be able to visit until after 25th March and agreed to await the outcome of Brexit before requesting visiting dates.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>9. Next Meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the next meeting would be held in Blampied Room, on 25th February at 1pm, followed by a public hearing with the Chief Executive, Catherine Madden and other senior officers at 2pm. The Committee extended an invitation to the Chair of the Audit Committee to view the public hearing and to attend a private meeting with the PAC subsequently.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>

## Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 25th February 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Connétable John Le Bailly Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott
Apologies	Deputy Carina Alves
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer
In attendance for Item 4 (Public Hearing) only	Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General (DC&AG) Charlie Parker, Chief Executive Ian Burns, - Director General, Employment and Social Security Catherine Madden, Chief Of Staff Kevin Hemmings, Head of Decision Support (Treasury)

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Minutes</b>	
The Committee approved the minutes of the meeting of 11th January 2019.	
<b>2. Declaration of Interests</b>	
None declared.	
<b>3. C&amp;AG Audit Plan 2019</b>	
The C&AG advised on the progress of several reviews and told the Committee she would provide a fuller written update at the March meeting. The Chairman advised the PAC might want to follow up on the report on Police Governance but that this could be decided after related questions had been raised in the States Assembly.	<b>CT</b>
<b>4. Public Finance Law</b>	
The Committee recalled that the Chairman had been co-opted onto the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) to review the Law. The Panel had held a second private briefing with the Treasurer and senior officers and a follow-up letter had been sent to the Minister requesting a delay in the lodging of the draft Law. The Committee noted that the Panel had received a reply declining to delay the draft and this would be discussed further at its next meeting on 28th February. The Committee noted the C&AG would provide comments on the proposed Law insofar as it facilitated the implementation of her recommendations.	<b>CT</b>
<b>6. Recurring Themes Review</b>	
The Committee noted a draft report on Organisational Culture and Corporate Learning. Ms Scott asked to add certain additions to the draft report, and the Chairman agreed supporting evidence should be identified in the transcript of the relevant public hearing, and sent to the Officer.	<b>CT</b>
<b>7. Review of Estate Management</b>	



The Committee noted the follow up public hearing would take place on 15th July 2019 at 2pm with the Director General, Growth Housing and Environment.	<b>CT</b>
<b>9. Public Hearing with Chief Executive</b> The Committee welcomed the Chief Executive, Catherine Madden and other senior officers at 2pm, to answer questions in relation to decision making by the Executive. The Committee extended an invitation to the Chair of the Audit Committee to view the public hearing and to attend a private meeting with the PAC subsequently.	<b>CT</b>

## Public Accounts Committee Record of Meeting

Date: 11th March 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott
Apologies	Deputy Carina Alves Deputy Rowland Huelin
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer Deputy Inna Gardiner

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Welcome</b></p> <p>The Committee welcomed newly-elected Deputy Inna Gardiner to observe the meeting and noted she would be officially appointed as a member of the PAC at the States Assembly meeting on 12th March 2019. It also noted Deputy Carina Alves would resign from the Committee on the same day, and requested the officer to extend thanks to Deputy Alves for her input into the Committee's work.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>2. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>The Committee considered the terms of reference and organisational structure of the newly formed Political Oversight Group (POG) and noted its remit was to oversee the governance, development and delivery of the OneGov programme. Connétable John Le Bailly advised he had been invited to join the POG but that he would be conflicted in many areas of work undertaken by the C&amp;AG and PAC, so it may constitute a conflict of interest to do so. He advised he would resign from the Group and would remain a member of the PAC.</p> <p>Ms Scott advised she had been asked to join a Statistics Users' Group and would confirm its formal name and remit by the next meeting.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>3. C&amp;AG Audit Plan 2019</b></p> <p>The Committee noted a written audit plan and the C&amp;AG advised on the progress of several reviews. It noted that a follow-up report on the States as Shareholder would be published on Thursday 14th March and several reports were due to be published in the next two months. The Committee asked the officer to request Executive Responses on their publication as a matter of course. The PAC agreed it would wish to follow up on areas such as Police Governance and the officer was requested to circulate the Executive Response to the previous Police Governance report, and ask the Chief Officer for an update.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>4. Public Finance Law</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled that the Chairman had been co-opted onto the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) to review the Law. The Committee noted that the Law would be lodged au Greffe imminently and the CSSP would have a public hearing with the Treasury Minister on 28th March 2019. A CIPFA member, Mr Stuart Fair, had been</p>	<b>CT</b>

<p>engaged as a consultant to undertake a desktop analysis of the draft Law, and letters to stakeholders inviting their comments would be sent shortly. The Committee noted the C&amp;AG had provided comments on the proposed Law insofar as it facilitated the implementation of her recommendations. The Committee requested the officer to provide a written update for future PAC meetings.</p>	
<p><b>5. Recurring Themes Review - Organisational Culture Report</b></p> <p>The Committee noted a draft report on Organisational Culture and Corporate Learning and agreed a form of words to be added to the report. It approved the draft, subject to the amendment and review of findings and recommendations, and requested the factual content be circulated to stakeholders.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>6. Recurring Themes Review - Decision-Making Report</b></p> <p>The Committee, having reviewed the transcript of its recent public hearing with the Chief Executive, agreed it would focus its report and follow-up questions to three areas: the hospital, the office move to Broad St and the consolidation of services at La Motte Street. It agreed follow-up questions to be sent to the Chief Executive. It further agreed that questions which fell outside that scope (e.g. IT matters) would be issued in a separate letter and form the basis of a later report.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>7. Recurring Themes Review - Management Information Report</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed to invite John Quinn, Chief Operating Officer and John Laverick, Chief Information Officer, to a private briefing on 25th March 2019 and requested members to send potential question areas to the officer before that date.</p> <p>The Committee further agreed to collate the information received by the officers to form part of its management information report. It also asked the officer to request information on IT matters (including customer service strategy) from the Chief Executive.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>8. Review of Estate Management</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the follow up public hearing would take place on 15th July 2019 at 2pm with the Director General, Growth Housing and Environment and agreed to formulate questions for that hearing at a later date.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>9. HSSD update</b></p> <p>The Committee noted an update from the Health and Social Services Department on implementation of C&amp;AG recommendations. However, it was disappointed to note that the update did not include a plan for implementation of recommendations relating to the future hospital decision making process and asked the officer to seek clarity from the Director-General on this matter.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>10. Next meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the next meeting of 25th March 2019 would include a private briefing by the Chief Operating Officer in charge of internal information operations.</p>	

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 25th March 2019

Present	<p>Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman            Connétable John Le Bailly            Deputy Rowland Huelin (for Item 5a only)            Deputy Inna Gardiner            Mr Adrian Lane            Mr Tim Rogers            Ms Moz Scott</p>
In attendance	<p>Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG)            Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer            Sheron Sloan, Assistant Scrutiny Officer            John Quinn, Chief Operating Officer (Chief Ministers) (Item 5a only)            John Laverick, Chief Information Officer (Information Services)            (Item 5a only)</p>

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Membership of PAC</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that Deputy Carina Alves, former Vice-Chairman of the Committee had resigned, as of 12th March 2019, and formally welcomed newly-elected Deputy Inna Gardiner as a member of the PAC. The Chairman advised she would consider who to invite to become the new Vice-Chairman in time for the next meeting.</p>	
<p><b>2. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of 25th February and 11th March 2019.</p>	
<p><b>3. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>Connétable John Le Bailly advised he had resigned from the Political Oversight Group and would remain a member of the PAC.</p> <p>Ms. Scott advised she had been asked to join the Statistics Users' Group, but it was not considered a conflict of interest with PAC work.</p> <p>The Chairman agreed to clarify with Deputy Huelin the nature of his work as a member of the Digital Policy Review Board and whether that would conflict with the PAC's work on Management Information as part of its Recurring Themes review.</p>	CT
<p><b>4. Audit Plan</b></p> <p>The Committee received a verbal update from the C&amp;AG and noted that her follow-up report on the States as a Shareholder had been published on 14th March 2019 and an Executive Response to that report had been requested by the officer. A report on the States Employment Board was due to be published before the end of March 2019.</p> <p>The Committee further noted the C&amp;AG's follow-up report on Community and Social Services for Adults and Older Adults would be published in early April and the officer would request an Executive Response on her return from annual leave. The</p>	CT

<p>Committee noted that a new Chief Operating Officer would be in post by then, and agreed it would wish to discuss with her how she intended to implement the recommendations of the C&amp;AG's report at a later date.</p> <p>The Committee noted a project specification for a follow-up report on Financial Management and Internal Control.</p>	
<p><b>5. Recurring Themes Review:</b></p> <p><b>a. Management Information</b></p> <p>The Committee welcomed John Quinn, Chief Operating Officer and John Laverick Chief Information Officer, to a private briefing on IT and Information Systems. The Committee heard of the progress being made since they had both been in post and agreed it would wish to view the business case for an overhaul of the current IT systems. The Committee also noted plans for recruitment and training of IT specialists.</p> <p>Following the briefing, the Committee agreed it would wish to seek clarification on a number of points raised and requested the officer to collate a list of questions for circulation. The Committee, having recalled it had already sought clarification on a number of issues with the chief Executive, agreed to await his response before seeking further clarification on related confidential matters raised at the briefing.</p> <p><b>b. Organisational Culture and Corporate Learning</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the report was being redrafted and would be recirculated in early April. The Committee noted that the revised timetable for release of the report would be more in step with the release of C&amp;AG reports.</p> <p><b>c. Decision-Making</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the Chairman had agreed to a request by the Chief Executive and Treasurer of the States for a short delay in submitting information related to this part of the review.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>6. Draft Public Finances Law – (PFL)</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled the Chairman had been co-opted onto the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP). It noted a paper reflecting the progress made by that Panel in scrutinising the proposed Law. The Committee noted a public hearing was to be held on 28th March with the Treasury Minister and asked the officer for a copy of the transcript of that hearing as soon as it became available. The Committee agreed it would then compile a list of questions for the Panel to incorporate into its follow-up letter to the Treasury Minister.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>7. Communications</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed it would wish to make comments relating to the C&amp;AG's reports on the States Employment Board and Community and Social Services for Adults and Older Adults shortly after their publication.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>8. Next meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted its next meeting would be held on 29th April 2019, at 1pm, in the Blampied Room, but agreed to hold e-meetings in the interim period.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 29th April 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer Sheron Sloan, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Membership of PAC</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the Chairman's nomination of Connétable John Le Bailly as Vice-Chairman of the Committee.</p>	
<p><b>2. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 25th March, subject to a minor amendment.</p>	
<p><b>3. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>Connétable Le Bailly advised he had been invited to join a Housing Policy Development Board. The Committee asked Connétable Le Bailly to submit the names and terms of reference of the Board so it could be determined whether it would conflict with future work of the PAC.</p> <p>Deputy Huelin advised he was now a member of four groups including a Migration Policy Development Board, and Technical Advisory Board supporting the formation and evolution of policy and legislation in respect of the government's digital aspirations. He agreed to submit the names and terms of reference of the various groups so it could be determined whether they posed conflicts of interest with work undertaken by the PAC. The Committee agreed that matters relating to its current Management Information review may cause such a conflict and that the evidence collated thus far would not be circulated to Deputy Huelin until such time as the details of the various groups could be determined.</p>	CT
<p><b>4. Appointment of new auditors for the States of Jersey accounts.</b></p> <p>The Committee received a verbal update from the C&amp;AG in respect of the process for appointing new auditors for the States of Jersey accounts. The Committee, having recalled that the appointment was made by the C&amp;AG, noted that presentations by the three shortlisted firms would take place on 14th May. The Committee further noted that the C&amp;AG would be assisted by an advisory panel comprising the Treasurer of the States, the Chair of the Audit Committee and the Deputy C&amp;AG.</p>	

<p>The Committee requested to meet with the auditors of the 2018 accounts at its July meeting and with the newly appointed auditors later in the year.</p>	
<p><b>5. Annual Report and Accounts for Comptroller and Auditor General</b></p> <p>The Committee received and reviewed the draft Annual Report and Accounts for the C&amp;AG. It noted savings had been achieved by relocating the office of the JAO and changes to staffing. The Committee also noted the performance report, accountability report and accounts contained within the substantive report, together with indications of the work the C&amp;AG would undertake in the final year of her tenure. The Committee thanked the C&amp;AG for supporting the PAC in its work and for planning the transition to her successor.</p>	
<p><b>6. Executive Responses to C&amp;AG Reports</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled it had requested Executive Responses to the following C&amp;AG reports:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a) States Employment Board – Executive Response due on 13 May 2019</li> <li>b) Community and Social Services for Adults and Older Adults – Executive Response due on 23 May 2019</li> <li>c) Housing Maintenance - Executive Response due on 6 June 2019</li> </ul> <p>The Committee also noted an Executive Response to the C&amp;AG Report of ‘States as a Shareholder’ had been received by its due date, and agreed to present it to the States with its own comments attached. Members agreed to send their comments within a few days to the Chairman and officer so a collated comments paper could then be circulated for approval.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>7. C&amp;AG communication with Health and Social Services Scrutiny Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel had sought clarification from the C&amp;AG on the Health Minister’s Ministerial Response to the C&amp;AG’s recently published Health Governance Report. The Committee noted the letter of reply from the C&amp;AG dated 16th April 2019 to the Scrutiny Panel, affirming her overall satisfaction at the quality of the Ministerial Response to the Health Governance report, but reiterating the potential threats to the implementation of her recommendations.</p>	
<p><b>8. Treasury and Exchequer response to C&amp;AG comments on Public Finances (Jersey) Law 201- (PFL)</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled that the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel (CSSP) had published comments by the C&amp;AG on the proposed draft PFL. The C&amp;AG’s comments had been confined to how the proposed Law could facilitate the implementation of her recommendations on financial management, as laid out in her previous reports. The Committee noted a response from the Treasurer of the States to the CSSP, advising that the C&amp;AG’s comments had been taken into consideration and laying out steps taken to facilitate her recommendations in the drafting of the Law.</p>	
<p><b>9. Non-Ministerial Departments</b></p> <p>The Committee received a detailed project specification for the C&amp;AG’s planned review of non-Ministerial Departments. It noted that for 2018 the total net revenue budget for those departments, which were directly accountable to the States Assembly, was around £29 million. The Committee noted the main purpose of the review was to evaluate the arrangement of governance and support for the non-Ministerial departments.</p>	

<p><b>8. Public Finances Law Sub-Panel and OneGov Review Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee received a progress report on the work of the Public Finances Law Sub-Panel and the OneGov Review Panel. The Chairman, a member of both, advised that the CSSP had finalised a comments paper on the draft Public Finances (Jersey) Law and would 'call in' the Law on its presentation to the States on 30th April 2019. The sub-Panel had been established to continue scrutinising the proposed Law and consider bringing amendments to it.</p> <p>The OneGov Review Panel was at the opening stages of its work and as yet had not held any hearings, but as it was scrutinising many areas adjacent to the PAC's own recurring themes review it was agreed close liaison between the Review Panel and the Committee would continue.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>10. Recurring Themes Review:</b></p> <p><b>Organisational Culture and Corporate Learning</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the Chairman had added additional comments to the draft report, and after discussion, agreed that further comments by the Committee should be supplied to the officer by Friday 3rd May so that a finalised version of the report could be circulated the following week. The Committee noted that this could delay further the publication, but agreed that it would wish the report to reflect accurately the updated information recently received from the Chief Executive on his change programme.</p> <p><b>Decision-Making</b></p> <p>The Committee noted it had received a wealth of information from the Chief Executive as follow-up material from its hearing of 27th March, but had not had sufficient time to discuss how this could be distilled into a report on decision-making. The Committee agreed it would want to discuss further at the next meeting.</p> <p><b>Management Information</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled that it had originally wished to draft a report on Management Information following the decision-making report, however it agreed that due to the delay in compiling that report, and having received a vast array of documentation from the Chief Executive about ongoing plans for the change programme, it would prefer to follow-up with a Management Information public hearing after the planned Financial Management hearing in early autumn. The Committee also noted this plan would fall in step with planned follow up reviews by the C&amp;AG.</p> <p>The Committee therefore requested the officer to advise the Executive that the planned quarterly public hearing in June 2019 with the Chief Executive should be used to scrutinise the progress of implementing the recommendations of the C&amp;AG, including viewing interactive spreadsheets compiled by the Office of the Chief Executive.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>11. Health and Community Services correspondence</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled it had requested the Health and Community Services Department to produce more detailed updates in respect of implementing C&amp;AG recommendations. The Committee received a bundle of documents and agreed to consider them carefully and discuss further at the next meeting. It also noted that Caroline Landon, the new Director General for Health and Community Services, had agreed to attend a public hearing on 21st October 2019 to advise on progress since she had been in post.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>12. Work Programme</b></p>	



The Committee agreed to review its work programme at the next meeting.	CT
<b>13. Next meeting</b> The Committee noted its next meeting would be held on 20th May 2019, at 1pm, in the Blampied Room, States Buildings.	

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 20th May 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 29th April 2019.</p>	
<p><b>2. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>Connétable Le Bailly advised he had been invited to join a Housing Policy Development Board and would submit its Terms of Reference in due course. The Committee agreed that it would then determine whether the Board's remit posed potential conflicts of interest with work undertaken by the PAC. The Committee, having noted that Deputy Huelin sat on four advisory boards, noted the terms of reference of two of them and requested he obtain the remaining two as soon as they were available.</p> <p>The Committee agreed that if a board were to make decisions on policy it would be deemed a conflict of interest were a member of that board to then review the implementation of that policy as a member of the PAC. However if the purpose of the boards were to be as a way to consult and advise, this would not necessarily pose such conflict. The Committee agreed that the terms of reference it had viewed appeared to be vague and wide-ranging and did not offer clarity on their status or purpose. It agreed to ask the Chief Minister for a list of the policy development or advisory boards (and members' names) and their status and function. It agreed that it should then be able to determine whether conflicts of interest were likely to occur with the future C&amp;AG or PAC work programme.</p>	CT
<p><b>3. C&amp;AG Audit Plan</b></p> <p>The Committee noted a written update of the C&amp;AG's audit plan, including changes to reflect the volume of corporate work currently in progress within the public sector. It noted that PwC had issued an unqualified Auditor's Opinion on the States Accounts which was published on 18th April 2019. It further noted that the fieldwork on the review of 'Handling and Learning from Complaints' had been paused to allow further changes to be implemented by officers. The C&amp;AG advised that she would not commence any new reviews at this stage so that the current reviews could be completed and a preliminary work programme established with the new C&amp;AG by December 2019, if required. She advised that the Attorney General had confirmed she should be able to offer additional handover advice to the incoming C&amp;AG if requested.</p>	

<p><b>4. Executive Responses to C&amp;AG Report</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled it had requested an Executive Response to the C&amp;AG report on Community and Social Services for Adults and Older Adults, which had been due on 23rd May 2019. The C&amp;AG told the Committee that she had been in talks with senior officers of the Health and Community Services Department. She advised that she was in agreement with their request for a short delay of up to two weeks so that they might commit to implementing the recommendations of her report and provide a satisfactory action plan to the Committee. The Committee agreed to the delay.</p> <p>The Committee also noted it was expecting an Executive Response to the C&amp;AG's Report on Housing Maintenance on 6th June 2019. The Committee recalled the C&amp;AG's report had been positive with few recommendations and was therefore not anticipating a request for a delay to the Executive Response.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>5. Executive Response to the C&amp;AG Report on States Employment Board (SEB)</b></p> <p>The Committee received an Executive Response to the C&amp;AG's report. The Committee was pleased to note that the response accepted the recommendations made by the C&amp;AG and contained an action plan and timetable for implementation of the recommendations. However it also noted that the ambitious change programme would be undertaken by the Director of People Services in the Chief Operating Office, a post which had been recently vacated. The Committee agreed to present the Executive Response to the States, with its own comments attached and requested the officer to circulate draft comments for approval in the next few days.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>6. Executive Response to the C&amp;AG Report on States as Shareholder</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled it had received an Executive Response to the C&amp;AG's report. It was disappointed to note that the rationale for States' ownership of several companies was still not clear. It also noted that the Government did not anticipate completing a review of the effectiveness of new arrangements for oversight of controlled companies until 2020. The Panel approved draft comments on these matters and asked that they be presented with the Executive Response to the States Assembly.</p>	
<p><b>7. Public Finances Law Sub-Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled that the Chairman was a member of the Public Finances Law sub-Panel and received a progress report on its work to date. It noted that the sub-Panel would lodge amendments to the proposed Public Finance Law on Monday 20th May 2019. These would include amendments to strengthen the wording around the internal audit function and the professional standards needed for the Public Finances Manual.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>8. OneGov Review Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee, having recalled that the Chairman was a member of the OneGov Review Panel, received a progress report on its work. The Committee noted the Review Panel had requested the Chief Executive to provide his job description and remit, reports undertaken by the transition team and spend on OneGov together with projected costs. It further noted that public hearings were to be held with Team Jersey and the Chief Executive on 21st June 2019.</p> <p>The Committee noted the Terms of Reference of the OneGov Review Panel were wide-ranging and requested that the Chairman confirm with the Review Panel that its focus remain on scrutinising political accountability of the OneGov programme and did not cross over into the Committee's remit of scrutinising its implementation.</p>	

<p><b>9. Organisational Culture and Corporate Learning Report</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the recent presentation to the States and subsequent publication of its report and agreed to request an Executive Response to its recommendations.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>10. Decision-Making Report</b></p> <p>The Committee noted it had received a large volume of information from the Chief Executive and agreed that Mr Tim Rogers should take the lead in preparing a report with the officer. It agreed the report should focus on two decisions made by the Chief Executive, namely the move of staff from Cyril Le Marquand House to Broad Street premises and the siting of a customer services hub at La Motte Street premises.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>11. Work programme</b></p> <p>The Committee considered an amended work programme. It recalled that it had originally wished to draft a report on Management Information following the decision-making report, however it agreed that it should delay such a report until after the Financial Management review by the C&amp;AG in September.</p> <p>The Committee also decided to postpone the scheduled public hearing of 3rd June 2019 in favour of a private meeting with the Chief Executive and Chief of Staff so that it could review the interactive data set charting the implementation of recommendations of the C&amp;AG. It agreed its findings should be made public by way of its review into management information.</p> <p>The Committee noted that Anna Blackman, PwC had accepted an invitation to its meeting of 1st July 2019 and therefore asked the officer to amend the scheduled public hearing with the Director of Estates and the Director-General Growth, Housing and Environment to a later time that afternoon.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>12. Scrutiny resources</b></p> <p>The Committee, having reviewed information from the Chief Executive in relation to the public sector transformation programme, expressed its concern at the apparent disparity between resources (human and financial) allocated to Government-supported departments and Ministers and those allocated to non-Ministerial departments and backbenchers/Scrutiny Panel members. It agreed that the strengthening of the Government branch should be counterbalanced by an ability by Scrutiny to have effective oversight over its functions. The Committee agreed that the Chairman should raise this issue at the next Chairmen's Committee.</p>	
<p><b>13. Next meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted its next meeting would be held on 3rd June 2019 at 1pm in the Blampied Room, States Buildings.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 3rd June 2019

Present	<p>Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman            Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman            Deputy Rowland Huelin            Deputy Inna Gardiner            Mr Adrian Lane            Mr Tim Rogers            Ms Moz Scott</p>
In attendance	<p>Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG)            Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer</p> <p><u>Item 9 only</u>            Charlie Parker, Chief Executive            Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff, Chief Ministers' Department            Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit, Treasury and Exchequer            Kevin Hemmings, Head of Decision Support, Treasury and Exchequer            Simon Clayton, Data Analyst, Chief Operating Office</p>

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes, subject to minor amendments, of its meeting held on 20th May 2019.</p>	
<p><b>2. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled it had asked the Chief Minister for a list of the policy development or advisory boards (and members' names) and their status and function. It agreed that it should then be able to determine whether conflicts of interest were likely to occur with the future C&amp;AG or PAC work programme.</p> <p>Connétable Le Bailly submitted a copy of the Housing Policy Development Board Terms of Reference and requested it be circulated to members for discussion as to whether the Board's remit posed potential conflicts of interest with work undertaken by the PAC.</p> <p>The Committee, having noted that Deputy Huelin sat on four advisory boards, noted the terms of reference of two of them and requested he obtain the remaining two as soon as they were available.</p> <p>The Committee noted Mr Rogers had worked on preparing Memoranda of Understanding (MOU) for Jersey Telecoms and other departments approximately thirteen years ago. It agreed this might present a conflict of interest should the Committee undertake work in this area as the MOUs were still in use.</p> <p>The Committee noted that Ms Scott had entered into email correspondence with the Chairman of the Privileges and Procedures Committee (PPC) and copied in other States members, including the Chief Minister. It was noted she had sought information</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>

<p>about regulatory and organisational practices of the Planning Committee in her capacity as a member of the St. Brelade's Bay Association, but had also mentioned her role as a member of the PAC. The Chairman of the PPC referred her to the relevant paragraphs of the Code of Practice for PAC and Scrutiny members. He also advised that he had forwarded the correspondence to the President of the Chairmen's Committee because of his concern that there may be a conflict of interest by conflating her roles as an independent member of the PAC and a member of the Association. Ms Scott, having acknowledged that there could be a perception of a conflict of interest apologised to the Committee and the Chairman of the PPC and advised she would take care not to conflate the roles again.</p>	
<p><b>3. C&amp;AG Audit Plan</b></p> <p>The Committee received a verbal update of the C&amp;AG's audit plan, including a minor change to the project specification relating to her review on 'Use of enforcement powers'.</p>	
<p><b>4. Executive Responses to C&amp;AG Reports</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the recent publication of the C&amp;AG's report on 'Arrangements for FOI: Follow-up' and that an Executive Response had been requested for 28th June 2019, together with an Executive Response for the PAC's report on 'Organisational Culture'. It noted the Chairman had agreed to a delay until 12th June 2019 for the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG's report on 'Community and Social Services for Adults and Older Adults'. The Executive Response on the C&amp;AG's report on 'Housing Maintenance and Repairs' was due on 8th June.</p> <p>The Committee recalled it had published comments on the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG's 'States as Shareholder' report on 23rd May 2019. Its comments on the Executive Response to her 'States Employment Board' report were published on 28th May.</p>	
<p><b>5. Public Finances Law Sub-Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled that the Chairman was a member of the Public Finances Law sub-Panel and received a progress report on its work to date. It noted that the sub-Panel's lodged amendments to the proposed Public Finances Law would be debated at the next States Assembly sitting on 4th June 2019.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>6. OneGov Review Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee, having recalled that the Chairman was a member of the OneGov Review Panel, received a progress report on its work. The Committee requested that the public hearings to be held with Team Jersey and the Chief Executive on 21st June 2019 should be transcribed overnight so that they would be available to the PAC as soon as possible.</p> <p>The Committee noted that the Chairman of the PAC had discussed in depth the remit of the OneGov Review Panel and was satisfied that the Review Panel's focus was on scrutinising political accountability of the OneGov programme and did not cross over into the Committee's remit of scrutinising its implementation. It further agreed the officers should maintain regular contact to ensure the avoidance of duplication of work.</p>	
<p><b>7. Private Briefing</b></p> <p>The Committee welcomed the Chief Executive and other senior officers to a private briefing on the Government's interactive data system, established to chart the implementation of recommendations of the C&amp;AG. The Committee heard that the programme was making it easier to monitor the progress of several recommendations</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>

<p>and identify 'blockages' to improvements. It was also easier to identify who was responsible for progressing key projects. The Committee agreed to hold a public hearing on 1st July 2019, covering the non-confidential aspects of the briefing.</p> <p>The Committee further agreed that members who required a more in depth understanding of the program's capabilities, should be given an opportunity to visit the Broad Street premises in the next few days. It requested the officer to make the necessary arrangements.</p>	
<p><b>8. Work programme</b></p> <p>The Committee considered an amended work programme. It agreed to hold a short public hearing on 1st July at 3pm with senior officers to make public the non-confidential parts of its private briefing today with the Chief Executive and Chief of Staff. The private briefing with Anna Blackman of PwC would be moved to a slightly earlier time to accommodate this.</p> <p>The Committee also agreed to hold a public hearing with the Director of Estates and the Director-General Growth, Housing and Environment on 15th July 2019. It agreed to consider following up on previous reports by the C&amp;AG such as 'Visit Jersey' and States as Shareholder' later in the year, and requested the officer to make preliminary arrangements.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>9. Decision-Making Report</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed to consider a draft report on decision-making at its next meeting.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>10. Next meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted its next meeting would be held on 17th June 2019 at 1pm in the Blampied Room, States Buildings.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 17th June 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes, subject to minor amendments, of its meeting held on 3rd June 2019.</p>	
<p><b>2. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled it had asked the Chief Minister for a list of the policy development or advisory boards (and members' names) and their status and function. It agreed that it should then be able to determine whether conflicts of interest were likely to occur with the future C&amp;AG or PAC work programme.</p> <p>The Committee noted the response on behalf of the Chief Minister which included links to the information held on the website for individual boards. However, it noted terms of reference for the 'Legislative Advisory Panel' and the PFOS board, amongst others, were not included.</p> <p>The Committee agreed that although the response on behalf of the Chief Minister was helpful in explaining the status of policy development boards, there was still an issue as to whether the advice given by these boards to the Minister(s) was consultative (i.e. offering feedback) or advisory (i.e. helping to shape policy decisions) in nature. Additionally, the terms of reference for some of the boards appeared to go beyond policy development, and into policy implementation. The Committee agreed it would want a list of attendees and members of these boards, together with the frequency of meetings in order to understand what effect, if any, their being would have on members' availability.</p> <p>The Committee was concerned that if the boards were advising the Government, members of those boards were adopting clear stated positions on policy (even if the advice was subsequently not acted upon or the member had opposed the board advice). This 'advocacy' stance could then be perceived as a conflict of interest, and would lead to the member not being able to partake in a subsequent scrutiny review (as a member of a Scrutiny Panel or PAC).</p> <p>The Committee also considered there may be an issue of perceived bias with the PAC's work programme, for example if the PAC decided to not review a certain topic</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>



<p>of policy implementation where some of the members had been active members of a policy development board.</p> <p>Connétable Le Bailly submitted a copy of the Housing Policy Development Board Terms of Reference and requested it be circulated to members for discussion as to whether the Board's remit posed potential conflicts of interest with work undertaken by the PAC. The Committee agreed that the way the terms of reference were worded in respect of the status of advice given to Ministers would constitute such a conflict.</p> <p>The Committee, having noted that Deputy Huelin sat on four advisory boards, noted the terms of reference of two of them and requested he obtain the remaining two as soon as they were available.</p> <p>Having noted the considerable time spent on determining matters of conflicts of interest in relation to membership of policy development boards at each PAC meeting, the Committee agreed it should refer the matter to the Chairmen's Committee and the Chief Minister for further discussion.</p> <p>The Committee noted that Ms Scott would not take part in the planned review of Visit Jersey in November, as she had prior contact with the organisation in her role as a member of the St. Brelade's Bay Association.</p>	
<p><b>3. C&amp;AG Audit Plan</b></p> <p>The Committee received a verbal update of the C&amp;AG's audit plan.</p>	
<p><b>4. Recruitment process of new C&amp;AG</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the appointment of a new C&amp;AG would need a proposition to be lodged jointly by the Chairman of the PAC and the Chief Minister. It noted that the process could take several weeks and requested the officer to work with the Chief Minister's officers to prepare a framework for the proposition, so that the procedure could be expedited as smoothly as possible.</p>	CT
<p><b>5. C&amp;AG visits to Jersey</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that due to several delays of flights from Gatwick to Jersey, the C&amp;AG had taken flights on a Sunday evening to ensure she could attend the PAC Monday meetings. She had been advised by the Population office that the Sunday travel was included in the 60-day limit of business days in the island and had calculated that she would therefore go over the limit by approximately four days by the end of the year. The Committee was concerned that the cost of applying for a licence was prohibitive and agreed that as she was conducting business on behalf of the States, the Chief Minister's office should be contacted in order to determine whether an exemption or waiver could be applied in this instance.</p>	CT
<p><b>6. Executive Responses to C&amp;AG Report on Community and Social Services for Adults and Older Adults</b></p> <p>The Committee welcomed the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG's follow-up report. Whilst broadly positive about the response, which fully accepted all the recommendations made, it agreed there were some concerns about the timetable for the proposed action plan. It also noted that some of the phrasing of the response seemed to suggest that the PAC would offer advice and guidance on the implementation of the actions and would monitor them in detail. The Committee agreed it would clarify its response to those points with comments of its own to be presented to the States at the same time as the Executive Response.</p>	CT

<p><b>7. Executive Response to C&amp;AG’s Report on Housing Maintenance and Repairs</b></p> <p>The Committee welcomed the Executive Response on the C&amp;AG’s follow-up report on ‘Housing Maintenance and Repairs’ and was pleased to note since the C&amp;AG’s first report was published in 2016, Andium Homes had adopted the recommendations and implemented a regime of repairs and maintenance. The Committee expressed some concerns about the lack of an estate management plan for States properties as a whole, but agreed that would be discussed at the follow up public hearing on 15th July 2019 with the Director-General of Growth, Housing and Environment and the Acting Director of Estates. The Committee agreed to present the Executive Response to the States, together with a comment expressing its overall satisfaction with the response.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>8. Public Finances Law Sub-Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled that the Chairman was a member of the Public Finances Law sub-Panel and received a progress report on its work to date. It noted that the amendments to the Public Finances Law had all been accepted and the Law should come into force in a couple of months, prior to the Government Plan being debated.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>9. OneGov Review Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee, having recalled that the Chairman was a member of the OneGov Review Panel, received a progress report on its work. The Committee heard that a public hearing with Senator Ian Gorst, in the context of his time as the former Chief Minister, had been held on 14th June and a transcript of that hearing would be circulated as soon as it became available. It noted that it would receive a transcript of the public hearings to be held with Team Jersey and the Chief Executive on 21st June 2019 that would be transcribed overnight so that they would be available to the PAC as soon as possible.</p> <p>With respect to the draft Government Plan being lodged in July 2019, the Committee noted that the current Employment Law would have to be updated in order to reflect the new responsibilities of Accountable Officers (AO) and the Principal Accountable Officer (PAO, the Chief Executive). The C&amp;AG raised a concern that, as a result of legislative changes, the Chief of Police, as Accountable Officer for the States of Jersey Police, was now accountable to the Principal Accountable Officer rather than directly to the States Assembly and that, consistent with the findings of her review of the Governance of the States of Jersey Police, this was not appropriate. The Committee was concerned that the accountability arrangements could lead to a perception that there could be undue influence over the operational aspects of the Chief of Police’s role. The Chairman agreed to express the Committee’s concerns to the OneGov Panel and to advise that all the existing laws which would be affected by the changing roles of AOs and the PAO should be aligned.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>10. Public hearing in respect of C&amp;AG recommendations’ database</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled its private briefing with the Chief Executive and other senior officers to discuss the Government’s interactive data system, established to chart the implementation of recommendations of the C&amp;AG. The Committee had agreed to hold a public hearing on 1st July 2019, covering the non-confidential aspects of the briefing. The Committee received draft questions to consider, and having asked the officer to amend and amalgamate them, requested that they be re-circulated within a few days so that it could allocate the questions to each member before the hearing.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>11. Public hearing in respect of Estate Management</b></p>	

<p>The Committee recalled it was to hold a public hearing with the Director of Estates and the Director-General Growth, Housing and Environment on 15th July 2019. It received draft questions in relation to that hearing and asked the officer to circulate an amended question plan for further discussion at its meeting of 1st July 2019. It also agreed it would be helpful to receive a screenshot of the recommendations database where it related to the outstanding issues of Estate Management and requested the officer to obtain that information in advance of that hearing.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>12. Decision-Making Report</b></p> <p>The Committee requested that a draft report be circulated and agreed to send amendments and suggestions to the officer via email so that the factual basis of the report could be sent to the Executive for comment in the usual way, within the next week.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>13. Next meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted its next meeting would be held on 1st July 2019 at the earlier time of 12:30, to include a private briefing by Anna Blackman of PwC at 1:30pm and a public hearing with the Chief of Staff and other senior officers at 3pm, in the Blampied Room, States Building.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 1st July 2019

Present	<p>Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman                  Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman                  Deputy Rowland Huelin                  Deputy Inna Gardiner                  Mr Adrian Lane                  Mr Tim Rogers                  Ms Moz Scott</p>
In attendance	<p>Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG)                  Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer                  Lindsey Power, Assistant Scrutiny Officer</p> <p><u>Item 6 only</u>                  Anna Blackman, PwC Auditor</p> <p><u>Item 7 only</u>                  Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff, Chief Ministers' Department                  Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit, Treasury and Exchequer                  Catherine Watson, Chief Internal Auditor, Treasury and Exchequer</p>

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 17th June 2019.</p>	
<p><b>2. Declaration of Interests</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the Chairman and the C&amp;AG had been invited to attend the Health and Community Services Board as an observer and agreed this did not constitute a conflict of interest.</p>	
<p><b>3. C&amp;AG Audit Plan</b></p> <p>The Committee noted an update of the C&amp;AG's audit plan and that she did not intend to publish any further reports before September 2019.</p>	
<p><b>4. Freedom of Information (FOI) Report</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the content of the Executive Response to the C&amp;AG's Report on Freedom of Information, specifically the long timescales allowed for implementing some of the recommendations. The Committee noted its concern that some key members of the Executive Team such as a Head of Information Management had not yet been appointed. Notwithstanding these observations, it agreed to monitor the implementation of the C&amp;AG's recommendations and to publish the Executive Response to the FOI report.</p>	
<p><b>5. Letter to the Treasurer of the States</b></p> <p>The Committee noted a letter dated 21st June 2019 from the C&amp;AG to the Treasurer in respect of the drive to bring forward the completion of the audit of the States of Jersey Accounts for 2019 to February 2020. Although the Committee was in favour of</p>	

<p>the Executive making arrangements to prepare accounts to a high standard and in a timely manner, it agreed the audit arrangements were a matter for the C&amp;AG. It noted the C&amp;AG's letter set out her experience of the preparation and audit of the States Accounts for 2018, which had been targeted for audit completion by March 2019 but had been completed in April 2019 due to some accounts not being ready. The Committee also noted that there would be a change of external auditors following a tendering process. The Committee noted that the C&amp;AG was to meet with the Chief Executive and the Treasurer to discuss her concerns about allowing adequate time for the new auditors to undertake a proper audit of the States Accounts.</p>	
<p><b>6. Audit of the States of Jersey Accounts for 2018 - Briefing</b></p> <p>The Committee received a briefing from Ann Blackman of PwC, the partner in charge of the audit of the States of Jersey Accounts for 2018. The Committee noted that she had a number of points of concern, including that there was pressure to produce a completed audit within a shorter timescale but without the necessary preparation of accounts being in place.</p> <p>It was noted that the concerns of the Auditor were directed to the Treasurer within document ISA260+ and the Committee directed the Officer to request a copy of the same from the States Treasurer and Exchequer Department. The Committee also noted that PwC had decided not to tender for the auditing of the States Accounts for 2019 as the company had been the States Auditors for a number of years. Ms Blackman advised this was in accordance with best practice in the UK to ensure probity and professionalism.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>7. Public Hearing relating to C&amp;AG / PAC recommendations</b></p> <p>The Committee welcomed the Chief of Staff and other senior officers to a public hearing. It asked the officers about the progress made in implementing the recommendations made in several C&amp;AG and PAC reports. The Committee heard that a database had been established with all of the recommendations listed on it and the information was in the process of being validated. The Chief of Staff told the Committee that it would be updated and used with the Director Generals of all departments in order to progress the implementation of recommendations. The proceedings were webcast and transcribed for publication on the States Assembly website.</p>	
<p><b>8. Organisational Culture: Executive Response</b></p> <p>The Committee considered an Executive Response to its report and agreed it was inadequate in the following areas:</p> <p>Recommendation 1 - there had been no clear commitment to the production of outcome measures;  Recommendation 2 – the term “significant slippage” needed to be defined;  Recommendation 3 – a target date should have been stated.</p> <p>In addition, the Committee agreed that the response, at 65 pages with an additional document, was too lengthy to publish in its current form. It agreed the Chairman should write to the Chief Executive, asking for further clarification on the points above and requesting a more succinct reply. An answer would be expected by 12th July 2019.</p>	<b>CT</b>
<p><b>9. OneGov Review Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee received a verbal update from the Chairman in respect of the Review Panel's actions and noted the content of the transcripts of the public hearings of 14th June and 21st June 2019.</p>	

<p><b>10. Chief Executive appraisal</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the content of the recently published appraisal, together with an accompanying note from the Chief Minister. It noted a comment by the independent appraisal referencing improving relations between the Chief Executive and the C&amp;AG and PAC and agreed that the Chairman should enquire how that assessment had been made without reference to the PAC or C&amp;AG.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>11. Public Hearing on Estate Management follow up</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed to send potential questions for the Director General of Growth, Housing and Environment and the Acting Director of Estates to the officer in advance of the public hearing on 15th July 2019. It noted a finalised question plan would be circulated to members with the next PAC agenda.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>12. Decision making report</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed that the Chairman should approve a 'factual content' version of the report to be sent to the stakeholders in advance of the next meeting of the PAC. It agreed to consider further the findings and recommendations of the report at the next meeting and that the final report should be published shortly thereafter.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>13. Publication of Executive Responses</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the Executive Responses to the C&amp;AG's reports on Housing Maintenance and Repairs Follow Up and Community and Social Services for Adults and Older Adults had been published.</p>	
<p><b>14. Next meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted its next meeting would be held on 15th July 2019 at 1pm in the Blampied Room, States Buildings, to include a public hearing at 2pm with the Acting Director of Estates and the Director General of Growth, Housing and Environment.</p>	

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 15th July 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott
Absent	Mr Tim Rogers
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer Lindsey Power, Assistant Scrutiny Officer  <u>Item 5 only</u> John Rogers, Director General of Growth Housing and Environment Tim Daniels, Acting Director of Estates, Property Services

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Minutes</b>  The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 1st July 2019.	
<b>2. C&amp;AG Audit Plan</b>  The Committee noted an update of the C&AG's Audit Plan. It noted that the C&AG was considering writing a 'legacy' report to aid her successor in identifying topic areas she had covered and that might need further work. She also advised she had met with the Minister for Treasury and Resources and the Treasurer of the States to explain her concern that the externally appointed auditors of the States of Jersey would be pressured by the Executive to bring forward the end date of its audit for the 2019 accounts. She reminded the PAC that it was solely within the C&AG remit to appoint the auditors and that it was only the preparation of the States accounts that was in the remit of the Executive, not the time allowed for the audit. The Committee noted that the C&AG had been unable to complete the contract with the proposed new auditors (Deloitte) because the current auditors (PwC) had not yet been paid for their additional fees. The additional fees had been incurred because PwC had flown extra staff from the UK to Jersey to complete the 2018 audit within a shorter timescale than had been previously agreed, and as requested by the States Treasury and Exchequer department.  The C&AG also commented that as the Risk and Audit Committee was currently inquorate, the PAC may be asked to oversee aspects of its remit.	
<b>3. Appointment of new C&amp;AG</b>  The officer advised she had contacted officers from the Office of the Chief Executive for an update on the preparation of a proposition to appoint the new C&AG, but had received no reply. The Committee directed the officer to continue her efforts to resolve the issue.	CT

<p><b>4. OneGov Review Panel</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the Review Panel was looking forward to receiving the Committee's report on Decision Making, and that a Government Plan Review Panel had been established to undertake a review of the Government Plan.</p>	
<p><b>5. Public hearing on Estate Management</b></p> <p>The Committee welcomed the Director General of Growth Housing and Environment and the Acting Director of Estates to a public hearing. It asked the officers about the progress made in implementing the recommendations made in several C&amp;AG and PAC reports. The hearing was webcast and the audio recorded in order that a transcript could be made.</p> <p>Having considered that very little progress had been made, the Committee agreed to compile a list of follow-up questions for the witnesses, and to invite them to return in six months for a further public hearing.</p>	CT
<p><b>6. Decision-making report</b></p> <p>The Committee considered the draft report and approved the same, subject to minor amendments to reflect comments made by the Executive. The Committee thanked Mr Tim Rogers for taking the lead in the review.</p>	CT
<p><b>7. Organisational Culture Report Executive Response</b></p> <p>The Committee reviewed an amended Executive Response to its report, and agreed that, although it was pleased with the more succinct response, it was frustrated with the lack of action taken to progress implementing some of the recommendations. The Panel agreed to present the Executive Response to the States Assembly with its own comments attached.</p>	
<p><b>8. Next meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed its next meeting would be held on 9th September 2019 at 1pm in the Blampied Room, States Buildings.</p>	



# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 9th September 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers (from Item 3)
Absent	Ms Moz Scott
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General (DC&AG) Caro Tomlinson, PAC Officer  <u>Item 6 only</u> Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Minutes</b>  The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 15th July 2019.	
<b>2. C&amp;AG Audit Plan</b>  The Committee noted an update of the C&AG's Audit Plan. It noted that the contract with the new auditors (Deloitte) had been agreed and the previous auditors (PwC) had been paid for their additional fees. It further noted that the C&AG was still awaiting a reply to her letter to the Treasurer dated 21st June 2019, which detailed her concerns about the drive to bring forward the arrangements for the completion of the audit of the States' 2019 accounts to 28th February 2020, three months in advance of the statutory deadline.	
<b>3. Appointment of new C&amp;AG</b>  The Committee noted the proposition to appoint the new C&AG would be proposed by the Chief Minister at the States Assembly meeting of 24th September 2019. It directed the officer to ensure members' questions relating to the proposed appointee be answered prior to the debate wherever possible.	CT
<b>4. Financial Management and Internal Control</b>  The Committee noted a draft report by the C&AG and that the final version would be published on 19th September 2019. It agreed it would wish to follow up on the report and include questions on its contents to the Chief Executive and the Treasurer at the quarterly hearing on 23rd September 2019. It further agreed that Mr. Lane should take the lead in the subsequent PAC review and preparation of questions for the public hearing.	CT
<b>5. Decision-making report</b>  The Committee considered the Executive Response to its report and agreed to present it to the States, with comments to follow. Having noted some minor misunderstandings	CT

<p>within the comments section of the Executive Response, the Committee also agreed that a delegation of PAC members should seek to meet informally with the Chief Executive to foster more positive communications between the parties.</p>	
<p><b>6. Private Briefing – Public Finances Manual (PFM)</b></p> <p>The Committee welcomed Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance and Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit to present their progress on the formulation of the Public Finances Manual (PFM) and noted the latest version of the document which would be used in conjunction with the new Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2019. It noted that the final version of the PFM would be published and updated at regular intervals.</p>	
<p><b>7. Proposition to request PAC to receive assessments</b></p> <p>The Committee considered a proposition which had been lodged by Deputy Geoff Southern, proposing that the PAC be requested to receive six-monthly assessments on planned efficiency savings, as specified in the Government Plan. The Committee agreed that it should be for the Government to produce such a document specifying planned efficiencies which could be scrutinised by the appropriate Panel, and that it would not have the resources to carry out the request. It agreed members should approach Deputy Southern to advise of its concerns in advance of the debate on 24th September and further agreed to prepare a comments paper detailing those concerns.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>8. Next meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed its next meeting would be held on 23rd September 2019 at 1pm in the Blampied Room, States Buildings and would include a public hearing at 2pm with the Chief Executive and Treasurer.</p>	

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 23rd September 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Adrian Lane Ms Moz Scott
Absent	Mr Tim Rogers
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General (DC&AG)  Sammy McKee, Scrutiny Officer Lindsey Power, Assistant Scrutiny Officer  <u>Item 7 only</u> Charlie Parker, Chief Executive Officer and Head of the Public Service Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 9<sup>th</sup> September 2019.</p>	
<p><b>2. Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) Audit Plan</b></p> <p>The Committee received a verbal update from the C&amp;AG regarding her Audit Plan. It noted that her Report concerning the remuneration of Board members had been sent out to stakeholders in final draft for consultation and was on track to be published in October. It was further noted that the C&amp;AG would provide the Committee with a written update at its next meeting.</p>	
<p><b>3. Financial Management and Internal Control</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the <a href="#">C&amp;AG's Report on Financial Management and Internal Control</a> had been published on 20th September and agreed to request an Executive Response thereto by Friday 1st November 2019. It was also agreed that once the response had been received, the Committee would issue a news release.</p>	CT
<p><b>4. Estate Management follow-up</b></p> <p>The Committee recalled that it had issued written questions following on from the Public Hearing held with the Director General of Growth Housing and Environment ("GHE") and the Acting Director of Estates held on 1<sup>st</sup> July 2019. The Committee noted that a response had been received but agreed that the answers provided lacked</p>	CT

<p>adequate detail. The Committee agreed to write to the Director General of GHE requesting detailed responses to all of the questions raised.</p> <p>The Committee considered the offer of a private briefing with the Director General of GHE and Acting Director of Estates but agreed that full answers to the questions raised should be provided in the first instance.</p> <p>It was noted that a Public Hearing with the Director General of GHE and the Acting Director of Estates was scheduled for 27<sup>th</sup> January 2020.</p>	
<p><b>5. P.88/2019- Government Plan: Assessment on planned efficiency savings</b></p> <p>The Committee noted a Proposition had been lodged by Deputy Geoffrey Southern with the States Assembly that sought to require the Committee to regularly assess the Government's planned efficiency savings.</p> <p>The Committee was advised that Deputy Geoffrey Southern had withdrawn the Proposition and that it would be amended to require the assessments to be carried out by the Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel and lodged for debate by the States Assembly on 8<sup>th</sup> October 2019.</p>	
<p><b>6. Monitoring of C&amp;AG/PAC recommendations</b></p> <p>The Committee noted a letter received from the Chief Executive Officer ("CEO") providing an update on the development of the C&amp;AG's recommendations, and received a verbal update on the informal meeting held by Connétable Le Bailly and Mr Lane with him on 19<sup>th</sup> September. It was informed that the meeting had been positive, and the CEO had accepted that the role of PAC was that of a critical friend. It was further noted that the CEO had requested that he be given appropriate notice of the PAC's work programme to facilitate the timely provision of information to the Committee.</p>	CT
<p><b>7. Financial Management: Public Hearing</b></p> <p>The Committee received Charlie Parker, CEO, and Richard Bell, Treasurer of the States, for a Public Hearing in respect of its review of Financial Management within Government. The proceedings were webcast live and the audio recorded so that a transcript could be produced.</p> <p>Following the hearing the Committee agreed to issue a news release acknowledging that significant progress had been made in improving the culture and practices around Financial Management, and that it looked forward to following up on further improvements and progress.</p>	
<p><b>8. Next Meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee agreed its next meeting would be held on 7<sup>th</sup> October 2019 at 1pm in the Blampied Room, States Building.</p> <p>The Committee noted that a Public Hearing was scheduled with Caroline Landon, Director General of Health and Community Services, regarding the Health Governance Reports on 21<sup>st</sup> October and agreed to review the reports for the purpose of constructing a Question Plan.</p>	

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 7<sup>th</sup> October 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Mr Adrian Lane Ms Moz Scott
Absent	Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Tim Rogers
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Deputy Comptroller and Auditor General (DC&AG)  Caro Tomlinson, Scrutiny Officer Lindsey Power, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 23rd September 2019.</p>	
<p><b>2. Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) Audit Plan</b></p> <p>The Committee received a written Audit Plan from the C&amp;AG. It noted that the C&amp;AG had received some observations from stakeholders on her forthcoming report on the remuneration of Board members, and it would be published on or around 24 October 2019.</p> <p>The Committee also noted a response from the Treasurer of the States to the C&amp;AG's letter sent to him on 21<sup>st</sup> June 2019, along with an Accounts Plan. It noted that the Risk and Audit Committee was still not quorate but could be by December 2019, however, that would give limited opportunity for oversight of the 2019 accounts. The PAC agreed to invite the Chair of the Risk and Audit Committee and the new external Auditors, Deloitte, to separate private briefings on 11 November 2019.</p>	CT
<p><b>3. C&amp;AG Appointment</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the States had approved the appointment of Lynn Pamment for a fixed seven-year term as Jersey's C&amp;AG to commence January 2020 and that she would attend the PAC meeting on 11<sup>th</sup> November 2019 as an observer.</p>	CT
<p><b>4. Estate Management follow-up</b></p> <p>The Committee had reviewed the further response from the Acting Director of Jersey Property Holdings to the follow-up questions from the Public Hearing. It agreed to accept his request for a private briefing on 25<sup>th</sup> November 2019.</p>	CT
<p><b>5. 2019-2020 Work Programme</b></p>	CT

<p>The Committee approved the work programme and agreed to the same being shared with the Chief Executive Officer at regular intervals.</p>	
<p><b>6. Decision making report</b></p> <p>The Committee considered publishing a comments paper following publication of the Executive Response to the report. It noted that there was incongruency between the written information provided and the verbal responses given at Public Hearings and determined that comments on this review would be drawn together when considering the next part of the Recurring Themes review.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>7. Quarterly Public Hearing with Chief Executive</b></p> <p>The Committee noted the next Public Hearing with the Chief Executive was scheduled for 9<sup>th</sup> December 2019. It agreed to review the transcript from the last Public Hearing and to send comments to Mr. Lane and the Scrutiny Officer for preparation of a draft Question Plan.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>8. Public Hearing with Director General of Health and Community Services</b></p> <p>Deputy Huelin informed the Committee that, as a member of the Future Hospital Political Oversight Group, he had seen the new Care Model report and could not participate in the Public Hearing with the Director General of Health and Community Services scheduled for 21<sup>st</sup> October 2019.</p> <p>The Committee noted the Health and Community Services PAC report that had been provided immediately prior to the meeting and noted that it failed to address the Report on services for adults and older adults.</p> <p>The Committee considered the draft Question Plan for the Public Hearing and noted that at the commencement of this meeting, the first six-monthly report had been received. It agreed to review thoroughly and amend the question plan accordingly.</p>	
<p><b>9. Code of Conduct</b></p> <p>The Scrutiny Officer advised the Committee that the draft Code of Conduct for non-States members of the Committee was not yet ready for review and the Committee deferred this matter to the next meeting.</p>	
<p><b>11. Communications</b></p> <p>The Committee discussed the issue of press releases being notified to the members but acknowledged that once a decision had been made to issue a press release and the form of words approved, it was unnecessary for the Scrutiny Officer to then specifically notify members of its release.</p>	
<p><b>12. Next Meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the next meeting would take place on 21<sup>st</sup> October 2019 at 1pm and would include a Public Hearing with the Director General of Health and Community Services.</p>	

# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 21st October 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin (withdrew for Item 6) Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers
Absent	Ms Moz Scott
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, Scrutiny Officer Lindsey Power, Assistant Scrutiny Officer <u>Item 6 only</u> Caroline Landon, Director General, Health and Community Services Rose Naylor, Chief Nurse, Health and Community Services Steven Mair, Financial Director, Health and Community Services

Agenda matter	Action
<p><b>1. Minutes</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 7th October 2019, subject to a minor amendment.</p>	
<p><b>2. Declaration of interests</b></p> <p>Deputy Huelin reminded the Committee that he could not participate in the public hearing with the Director General of Health and Community Services, as he was a member of the Political Oversight Group (POG) concerned with the future hospital.</p> <p>It was further noted by the Committee that, notwithstanding that Ms Scott was not in attendance, she would not be able to participate in any discussion or subsequent follow up work to the C&amp;AG's report on Remuneration of Boards.</p>	
<p><b>3. Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) Audit Plan</b></p> <p>The Committee received a verbal update from the C&amp;AG regarding her Audit Plan and noted that the C&amp;AG had held a preliminary handover meeting with the incoming C&amp;AG.</p>	
<p><b>4. Report on the Remuneration of Boards</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the C&amp;AG would release her report concerning the Remuneration of Board Members under embargo on Tuesday 22nd October, for publication on Thursday 24th October.</p>	
<p><b>5. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Executive Officer</b></p>	

<p>The Committee was reminded that a Public Hearing with the Chief Executive Officer was scheduled for 9th December 2019 and discussed topics which could be covered at that hearing. The Committee agreed to give further consideration as to whether the quarterly hearing should be focused on management information topics as part of its recurring themes review, or whether it should encompass other themes. The Officer was requested to prepare a draft Question Plan for further consideration.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>6. Public Hearing with the Director General of Health and Community Services</b></p> <p>The Committee received Caroline Landon, Director General, Health and Community Services, Rose Naylor, Chief Nurse and Steven Mair, Financial Director, Health and Community Services for a Public Hearing in respect of its review of the Governance Arrangements in Health and Community Services. The proceedings were webcast live and the audio recorded so that a transcript could be produced.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>7. Meeting with delegation from Deloitte UK</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that it was due to meet with Craig Wisdom, Partner at Deloitte UK, on 11th November 2019 to discuss aspects of auditing the States of Jersey accounts.</p>	
<p><b>8. Meeting with the Chair of the Risk and Audit Committee</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that it was due to meet with Vineeta Manchanda, Chair of the Risk and Audit Committee, on 11th November 2019 to discuss the role and operation of that Committee.</p>	
<p><b>9. Code of Conduct</b></p> <p>The Committee considered an early draft Code of Conduct intended to provide guidance for the independent (lay) members of the Committee. The Committee agreed to submit their comments to the Officer so that she could review and amend the draft accordingly.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>10. Communications</b></p> <p>Following the Public Hearing with the Director General of Health and Community Services the Committee agreed to issue a communication on social media acknowledging that it was pleased to note the progress that had been made in health governance but that there was still much ground to cover.</p>	<p>CT</p>
<p><b>11. Next Meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the next meeting would take place on 11th November 2019 at 1pm in the Blampied Room, States Building.</p>	



# Public Accounts Committee

## Record of Meeting

Date: 11th November 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman Deputy Rowland Huelin Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers
Absent	Ms Moz Scott
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Ms Lynn Pamment C&AG Appointee Caro Tomlinson, Scrutiny Officer Lindsey Power, Assistant Scrutiny Officer

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Welcome</b>  The Committee welcomed Lynn Pamment to the meeting as an observer in her capacity as the future C&AG from January 2020.	
<b>2. Minutes</b>  The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 21st October 2019, subject to a minor amendment.	
<b>3. Code of Practice for Engagement between PAC and Executive</b>  The Committee noted the established practice of engagement between the Committee and the Executive and other organisations as detailed in the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey. It was specifically noted that any request for information by the PAC must be approved by the Chairman and made formally through the Officer.	
<b>4. Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) Audit Plan</b>  The Committee received a verbal update from the C&AG regarding her Audit Plan and noted that the Report on Governance Arrangements for non-ministerial departments would be published in December.	
<b>5. Report on the Remuneration of Boards</b>  The Committee noted that the Executive Response to the C&AG's Report on the Remuneration of Boards was due on 2nd December 2019.	
<b>6. Private Briefing with Deloitte UK</b>	CT

The Committee received Craig Wisdom and Ben Sheriff of Deloitte to discuss aspects of the auditing of the States of Jersey annual accounts.	
<b>7. Private Briefing with Chair of Risk and Audit Committee</b>	
The Committee received Vineeta Manchanda, the Chair of the Risk and Audit Committee, to discuss the role of the Risk and Audit Committee and oversight of internal audit.	CT
<b>8. C&amp;AG Report on Financial Management and Internal Control</b>	
The Committee noted the Executive Response to the Report on Financial Management and Internal Control and agreed that it should be presented to the States Assembly and incorporated into the PAC's Report on Financial Management.	CT
<b>9. Health and Community Service Governance</b>	
The Committee noted the response received to follow-up questions issued on Governance in Health and Community Services. It approved comments to be incorporated into a Comments paper to be presented to the States Assembly.	CT
<b>10. Office Strategy – Members' briefing</b>	
The Committee noted the Office Strategy would be presented to the members on 14th November 2019 and that slides of the presentation would be made available to non-attendees after the meeting.	CT
<b>11. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Executive</b>	
The Committee considered a draft question plan for the quarterly public hearing with the Chief Executive scheduled for 9th December 2019 and agreed to amend further at its next meeting.	CT
<b>12. PAC Financial Management Report</b>	
The Committee agreed to consider an amended draft report at its next meeting.	CT
<b>13. Next Meeting</b>	
The Committee noted that the next meeting would be held on 2nd December 2019 at 1pm in the Blampied Room and would include private briefings from Jersey Property Holdings and the Executive Director of the Jersey Overseas Aid Commission.	CT

## Public Accounts Committee

### Record of Meeting

Date: 9th December 2019

Present	Senator Sarah Ferguson, Chairman Connétable John Le Bailly, Vice-Chairman
---------	--

	Deputy Rowland Huelin Deputy Inna Gardiner Mr Adrian Lane Mr Tim Rogers Ms Moz Scott
Absent	
In attendance	Comptroller and Auditor General (C&AG) Caro Tomlinson, Scrutiny Officer Lindsey Power, Assistant Scrutiny Officer  <b>Item 6 only</b> Charlie Parker, Chief Executive Officer Richard Bell, Treasurer Tom Walker, Director General Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff Mike Thomas, Director Risk and Audit Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance

Agenda matter	Action
<b>1. Minutes</b>  The Committee approved the minutes of its meeting held on 11th November 2019, subject to a minor amendment.	
<b>2. Code of Practice and Code for Engagement between PAC and Executive</b>  The Committee noted that there were no new declarations of interest under the Code of Practice. It also noted the established practice of engagement between the Committee and the Executive and other organisations as detailed in the Standing Orders of the States of Jersey.	
<b>3. Comptroller and Auditor General (C&amp;AG) Audit Plan</b>  The Committee received a written update from the C&AG regarding her Audit Plan. It noted that she would publish a 'Thinkpiece' on 18th December regarding governance in the public sector, as an alternative to a legacy report, drawing upon her reports of her seven year tenure. The Committee expressed its gratitude to her for all her work.	
<b>4. C&amp;AG's Report on Non-Ministerial Departments</b>  The Committee noted the C&AG's Report had been published and agreed to request the Executive Response by 31st January 2020, giving the Executive a longer time to respond due to the Christmas break. Having noted that recommendations 5 onwards were directed at non-Ministerial departments, the Committee agreed that the Response template should be circulated to those departments and that they could respond collectively or individually also by 31st January 2020.	<b>CT</b>
<b>5. PAC Financial Management Report</b>  The Committee approved the draft Report subject to inclusion of the Chair's foreword and requested the Officer to send it for quality assurance checking and to the stakeholders for factual checking.	<b>CT</b>
<b>6. Quarterly Public Hearing with the Chief Executive Officer</b>	

<p>The Committee welcomed Charlie Parker, CEO, Richard Bell, Treasurer, Tom Walker, Director General Strategic Policy, Planning and Performance, Catherine Madden, Chief of Staff, Mike Thomas, Director of Risk and Audit and Kevin Hemmings, Head of Financial Governance for a Public Hearing in respect of its review of the implementation of C&amp;AG and PAC recommendations within Government.</p> <p>It was noted that the Committee had received two documents a day in advance of the hearing, including progress updates on the implementation of recommendations and an outline of the technology transformation programme. In respect of the latter document, the Committee agreed to ask written questions of the Executive following the hearing.</p> <p>Proceedings were webcast live and the audio recorded so that a transcript could be produced.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>7. Report on the Remuneration of Boards</b></p> <p>The Committee discussed the Executive Response and agreed to present it to the States and publish thereafter, with its own comments attached. The Committee members agreed to forward their comments to the Officer for preparation of the paper.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>8. PAC Work Programme 2020</b></p> <p>The Committee approved the draft Work Programme and discussed the potential for a review of the Government’s funding of the Charity Sector. The Officer was requested to scope a possible review with the independent member, Tim Rogers, to lead on the review, and to share that with the new C&amp;AG before deciding when to commence it. The Committee also agreed to review Estate Management and the Office Strategy in the first quarter of the year, with a review of Management Information by the end of quarter two and hold more than one hearing on the States Accounts for 2019 in June 2020.</p> <p>The Committee further noted the quarterly hearings with the Chief Executive on 23rd March, 15th June, 21st September, and 30th November 2020 had been agreed with the Chief Executive.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>
<p><b>9. Next Meeting</b></p> <p>The Committee noted that the next meeting would be held on 20th January 2020 at 1pm in the Le Capelain Room and would include private briefings on the Jersey Standard Framework at 2pm and Estate Management at 3pm.</p>	<p><b>CT</b></p>